Minutes of Pre-Bid Meeting

for

Hiring of Company/ Firm for Third-Party Monitoring & Evaluation Services

Punjab Skills Development Fund

Meeting Date: February 21, 2022

The following members attended the meeting.

1. Mr. Ali Akbar Bosan, COO PSDF (Consultant Selection Committee Chair)
2. Mr. Syed Naveed Iqbal, Assistant Chief Consultancy, P&DD Representative (Member)
3. Mr. Shaheryar Hashim, CFA Representative of Finance Department (Member)
4. Mr. Faisal Rafiq, Head of Procurement PSDF (Secretary/Member)
5. Mr. Abdul Rauf, Head Monitoring & Evaluation PSDF (Co-opted Member)
6. Management Team

List of consultant firms who attended the meeting is given below.

Hiring of a Company/ Firm for Third-Party Monitoring and Evaluation Services			
Pre-Bid Meeting Date	**21-Feb-2022**	**Pre-Bid Meeting time**	**12:00 PM**
Sr. No.	**Vendor/Bidder name**	**Representative Name**	
01	KPMG Taseer Hadi & Co.	Usman Tariq Salik Mujeeb	
02	Riaz Ahmad, Saqib, Gohar & Co.	Umehani Virk	
03	Crowe Hussain Chaudhary & Co.	Sidra Anwar	
04	Associate in Development (AID Global)	Syed Basit	
05	FINCON SERVICES	Zyn Al Abidin Baig Faris Mir Hira Masood	
06	DevCon Development Consultants	Azhar Sharif Ms. Tania	
07	EY Ford Rhodes Chartered Accountants	Syed Ali Raza Rohail Bilal	

Disclaimer

All the responses below are for clarity purpose only. Proposal will be evaluated in light of RFP Document.

PART-1

Pre-Bid Meeting- Hiring of a Company/ Firm for Third-Party Monitoring and Evaluation Services

Minutes of Meeting

Meeting Date: Feb 21, 2022, Meeting Time: 12:00 PM

1. **What database PSDF uses? And how to access that database?**

   Answer: PSDF uses Business Support System (BSS), and Third-Party Monitoring (TPM) firm will use Android Management System (AMS), and both will be linked through Application Programming Interface (APIs). AMS will reside on consultant server whereas BSS will reside on PSDF server.

2. **It is written in instructions that JV/ Consortium is allowed whereas data sheet indicates that it's not allowed. Is JV/ Consortium allowed?**

   Answer: JV/ Consortium is not allowed. Instructions to consultants are generic clauses in positive term whereas data sheet explains the specific clause where mentioned.

3. **What is the date and method of submission of bid security?**

   Answer: Bid security in the form of CDR/ Demand Draft/ Pay Order must reach PSDF office before proposal submission deadline i.e., Feb 28, 2022, before 02:30 PM and a scanned copy must be attached with technical proposal on E-Tender Portal.

4. **Who will provide the list of training institutes??**

   Answer: PSDF has BSS system and class wise trainee data is available on system. TPM will fetch or download the data from system for planning their visits accordingly.

   Moreover, PSDF has target of 30,000-35,000 trainees for contractual year. Batch duration will be of 3 months each. However, duration of class varies, and list of Training Service Providers (TSPs) will be provided by PSDF on quarter basis. Location wise, trade wise, district wise lists are available on system and can be downloaded from there. There are 300-350 training locations where visits will be performed. Two types of visits will be performed.

   i) Pre-Training Center Inspection
   ii) Regular Monitoring visit

   Two visits will be performed for Formal Training Institute Location whereas one visit will be performed for Industry and Community Training Locations. Locations can be same or different for every TSP.

5. **What is the number of training institutes?**

Answer: This may vary depending on business needs. In start of contractual year, number of TSP will be less and will gradually increase. Last year we had 55,000 trainees and over 300 TSPs. However, it was clarified that payment will only be based on actual number of visits conducted.

6. **How many trades does PSDF work in??**
Answer: PSDF has worked in 600 trades, but it may vary as per nature of the contract with TSPs, and number of trades offered in a contract over the period of one year. However, Monitoring activity is not trade specific.

7. **For audited financial statements, if an organization's audit is in process for 2021 then what alternate documents can be provided?**

   Answer: As required in RFP every consultant has to provide audited copy of financial statements as specified in bidding document.

8. **TECH 2 requires organization's experience. What format can be used for that?**

   Answer: As per TECH 2, organization's experience must be provided in given format. However, if organization experience is required elsewhere then it must be provided as per the requirement defined in relevant section.

9. **When will training start?**

   Answer: Training will start in July 2022 and visits will start along with trainings.

10. **If a firm has no litigation history, then what will be written in affidavit for litigation history?**

    Answer: Consultant firm will declare clearly in affidavit that there is no litigation history with any government organization. Moreover, any litigation history with any government organization must be declared in affidavit for litigation history. A template for litigation history is given below at the end of this document.

11. **Since submission is online; if consultant faces any issue through online submission who will resolve the issue?**

    Answer: E-Tender Portal is used for online submission. Bidding document is attached on E-Tender portal and instructions are given clearly. There is no lag in the system and a good internet connection is needed for documents submission. After closing time, access will be denied for submission. Helpline number is given for support and available from 09:00 AM to 06:00 PM Monday-Saturday. A manual is also available on etender.psdf.org.pk for access and submission of documents online.

    Moreover, it is advised to read RFP instructions carefully before submission.

    If you face any further issues, you can contact procurement department through Procurement@psdf.org.pk or raise your query through message box of E-Tender Portal and response will be provided as per timelines mentioned in RFP document.

12. **Will affidavits be submitted along with bid security in hard form?**

    Answer: Yes. Affidavits and bid security are required in original hard form and their scanned copies must be attached on E-Tender Portal as well.

13. **How much time is needed for online submission of documents?**

Answer: Submission time depends on size of scanned documents and internet connectivity. System allows attachment up to 50 MB.

14. **Monitoring form and tools are developed already or TPM needs to draft them from scratch??**

Answer: All monitoring tools/ questionnaires are already developed. If there is a change in PSDF business rules, then PSDF will develop monitoring tools for TPM firms.

15. **Estimated monitoring time is 40 mins. Does this include taking attendance record, perception survey, training center inspection as well?**

Answer: Pre-center inspection visit does not include regular monitoring and regular recurring visit does not include pre-center inspection. Maximum time for regular visit is 40 mins and includes all aspects mentioned above in question.

16. **TECH 3 form relates to work plan. Does it have any words limit?**

Answer: No. There are no words limit but it is encouraged that work plan is precise and qualitative.

17. **Provide clarity on quarterly rotation plan of field staff.**

Answer: Quarterly rotation policy is to avoid visits by same filed staff. This is to avoid TPM-TSP collusion. Policy is to rotate filed monitors on quarterly basis and plan will be shared by TPM. Same field staff can visit the same location again but as per rotation policy of TPM firm.

18. **40% of Technical Evaluation Criteria relates to past experience of organization which requires client performance satisfactory letters as evidence. When an RFP is on EOI stage, organization gets ample time to get satisfactory letters from donors/ government agencies. It takes time to get those letters. It is requested to increase timelines for submission or add contracts/ POs in requirements as evidence.**

Answer: Purchase Orders (PO) and Contracts cannot establish completion of the projects therefore, completion letters/ performance satisfactory letters are required.
Moreover, submission timelines cannot be extended any further.

19. **Multiple Projects with same government agencies in different timeframe will be considered as separate projects?**

Answer: Yes. Multiple projects with same agencies will be considered as separate assignments. However, requirement is project based and not client based.

20. **Evaluation Criteria of Project Director includes finance qualification. Does that include any qualification relating to Chartered Accountancy as there are audit firms as well?**

Answer: Yes. It can be included but with equivalence. Equivalence Certificate should be submitted as evidence.

21. **What is the training percentage of community cost sharing and number of center inspections to be performed by TPM??**

Answer: We have 3 types of training programs.
i)   Formal Training Institutes (FTI) (40%)
ii)   Community Training (30%)
iii)   Industrial Training (30%)
Around 30% of total visits will be performed for pre-center inspection.

22. Which schemes will have on job trainings and what is the number of training visits covering on-job trainings?

Answer: Number of visits cannot be shared at this moment because on-job trainings depend on such schemes and their monitoring will be included in this assignment. These schemes may start in this year or next year. Further, PSDF will communicate the percentage of monitoring of on-job training programs.

23. Please provide clarity on AMS and BSS and how will these be linked? Cloud services are used to host AMS data services.?

Answer: BSS is for TSPs and PSDF whereas AMS is for TPM firm. AMS will reside on consultant firm server and BSS will reside on PSDF server and both will be linked through APIs. Cloud services are used to host AMS data services.

24. Does AMS has open data kit application used to collect data of field visits and store in AMS and BSS data base through web APIs??

Answer: All monitoring tools are developed in AMS. Data collection tools are mobile, or tablet based and on month end data is uploaded on BSS after data quality assurance. Tablets with installed AMS are provided to filed monitors for data collection. Once data is uploaded on consultant server then it is uploaded on PSDF BSS through APIs on month end and then will be integrated to BBS for further reporting.

25. Web services to link the BSS and AMS will be developed by TSP?

Answer: No. TPM firm will develop these web services.

26. What is the duration of quarter of batch of 400-450 for 1750 trainees? Is it 3 months or 6 months?? Provide clarity.

Answer: Target of trainees for contractual year is 30,000- 35,000 trainees. Quarter duration is 3 months. Trainee target is divided in 4 quarters. If there are less trainings in any given quarter, then it may be adjusted in next quarter trainings. Batch is for one quarter i.e., 3 months whereas class duration may vary from min. 1 month to max. 12 months. Most classes are of 3 and 6 months. Some agriculture classes are of 7 or 12 months. Maximum visits will be 300-350 for around 250 locations in any given month. It may increase or decrease depending on business needs.

27. Provide clarity on number of students in each class.

Answer: There are 20-25 students in each class. Drop out margin is 10%.

28. It is mentioned that there will be 300-350 visits in any given month. Please clarify that this month will be decided by PSDF or consultant?

Answer: Information of classes, TSPs and locations will be provided by PSDF at start of each month and will be available in AMS in downloadable form. Information of monthly visits will be provided by PSDF.

29. For team structure, regional/ district coordinator is required. Are there separate coordinators needed for each district or a single coordinator can cover multiple districts??

Answer: There are 36 districts in Punjab which are divided into 6 regions. District Coordinator can cover a whole region as well. Moreover, in a given quarter, all districts will not be monitored, so a

district coordinator can be a regional coordinator as well depending on the work plan provided by consultant.

30. **Do we need any filed supervisors as well?**

   Answer: Any other supervision role is not allowed. District/ regional coordinators will be supervisors and there will be a team of filed staff/ enumerators who will visit and collect data.

31. **Please define number of filed staff/ enumerators.**

   Answer: This will be provided by consultant in work plan required in approach and methodology. Workplan will be evaluated by PSDF.

32. **A presentation on approach and methodology is required. Only participants of pre-bid meeting will be invited to present or all firms who have applied?**

   Answer: All consultants those fulfilling mandatory requirements and found eligible for technical evaluation will be called for presentation.

33. **What is application of Template for Power of Attorney when JV/ Consortium is not allowed?**

   Answer: Power of Attorney represents the authorized representative of organization for signing the proposal submitted.

34. **If we propose 2-3 district coordinators in workplan, do we need to provide CVs of all or only 1 CV is enough?**

   Answer: CVs are required for all district coordinators proposed in workplan.

35. **Do we need to provide CVs of field staff/ enumerators as well?**

   Answer: CVs of all proposed staff are required. Instructions define all the requirements clearly. Please read them before submission.

36. **Kindly elaborate the maintenance cost of AMS.**

   Answer: AMS cost consists of software charges which will reside on consultant server and charges of usage of smart devices (tablets). There are two costs one being fixed and other being variable which will be of visit costs. Fixed cost will be lumpsum cost of AMs maintenance which will be paid on monthly basis along with cost of visits conducted in month.

37. **Associate or subsidiary firms are allowed to participate?**

   Answer: Not allowed.

38. **Is there a defined criteria for enumerators CV and what score will be assigned to them?**

   Answer: Criteria for enumerators is given below:

   Graduate or above in any discipline. Minimum 1 year of field monitoring experience.
   Scoring of enumerators will be a part of workplan.

39. **It is suggested to allow other qualified Professionals e.g., FCA, FCCA, ACMA, CMA, etc. have ample experience of performing similar nature assignments for the key staff positions.**

Answer: No. it is not allowed. Only equivalence is allowed with equivalence certificate if it matches with RFP criteria. For example, if finance degree is required then equivalence will be considered.

40. **Is there any minimum score for enumerators? Please provide criteria with minimum score for enumerators.**

Answer: Minimum score cannot be provided as workplan split will be disclosed. Moreover, PSDF will evaluate the team proposed in workplan. Number of staff and cost will be evaluated for workplan. Criteria of enumerators has been provided above in Question # 36.

41. **There is same qualification criteria for two IT experts. Please clarify.**

Answer: Only one IT expert is required. Criteria describes the slabs for scoring according to experience of IT expert. Maximum score will be awarded for experience of more than 5 years whereas 3 marks will be awarded for experience of 5 years.

42. **Is a professional needed for development and maintenance of data dashboard?**

Answer: TPM is required to provide data/ reporting related to AMS only. If TPM wants any other dashboard services like Crystal Reports / TABLO, it may use, and data may be provided accordingly. No additional reporting is required except AMS, and violations reported on AMS.

43. **What is the quarterly qualitative and quantitative analysis?**

Answer: PSDF requires qualitative and quantitative analysis/ violation reports from TPM on quarterly basis. Data uploaded on PSDF BSS will be further analyzed by PSDF.

In addition to above, some queries were received from consultant firms which are given below with answers.

PART-2

Answers to the queries submitted in writing by different consultant firms:

Questions for clarification:

1. **Further clarity is needed on the selection of classes for monitoring visits. We understand that overall, 1750 classes are expected to be started in 12 months' period. With the expected number of 300-350 visits in any given month by the TPM firm, a total of up to 4,200 visits will be carried out over the contract life. From this, we understand that more than one visit will be conducted to each of the 1750 started classes. Please confirm the scope and number of monitoring visits.**

   Answer: Scope of regular monitoring visits are as per business rules for formal, industrial and community training programs. Multiple classes at one location and one visit of one location is conducted by TPM. Further as per business rules 2 visits of formal training programs classes of any location of TSP is conducted in any given month. For industry and community one visit is conducted in a month.

2. **Are the monitoring forms/ tools already developed? Or is the TPM firm expected to prepare these from the scratch?**

   Answer: Monitoring forms/ tools already developed. Please refer to Question # 13 for the answer.

3. **Please clarify what the number of locations 250 refers to? Does it mean that PSDF trainings will be organized at 250 locations across 36 districts?**

   Answer: Locations are distributed in 36 districts of Punjab. Number of locations may vary from 250 in any given quarter depending upon the target.

4. **The estimated time of monitoring per class is 40 minutes. Does this estimate include time for training centre inspection, checking attendance records, perception survey with participants and verification of provision of other items including bags, uniform and consumables etc.? Please confirm.**

   Answer: Yes, regular monitoring visits include all above. However, training centre inspection is to be done through separate visit. Please refer to Question # 14 of Pre-Bid Meeting queries for the answer.

5. **Please clarify what does "Quarterly TSPs progress report (Dashboard)" under frequency of reporting and submission mean?**

   Answer: It is a violation summary report of TSPs as per business rules.

6. **Overall, reporting requires further clarity. It is noted that one monthly monitoring report is to be submitted. Will that include classroom, training venue inspection and other comparative monitoring data? Or those are to be submitted separately i.e., in addition to the monthly report?**

   Answer: Monthly monitoring visits include number of visits conducted by TPM as per business rules for classes and locations in PSDF system. Further all monitoring visits finding as per applicable business rules through android based management system (AMS). Quarterly/biannually/annually various trends of TSPs are separately reported.

7. **Under frequency of reporting and submission, Analytical (Qualitative and Quantitative) and comparative reports in each quarter and Monthly Trainee perception report submitted by TPM on monthly basis are separately listed. We understood from the TOR that qualitative data referred to perception survey. Please clarify if these are different types of reports and how?**

   Answer: Monthly trainee perception survey is different report and various quarterly trends (qualitative and quantitative) are separate.

8. **Does PSDF foresee data integration between PSDF DBMS and TPM's AMS? If yes, we understand that IT support for inter-platform transfer/ integration will be provided by PSDF's IT/MIS team. Please confirm.**

   Answer: AMS and PSDF BSS are already synced and integrated. Further integration of any upgradation requires IT support.

9. **Please clarify what does quarterly rotation plan mean under capacity building of TPM?**

   Answer: Quarterly rotation plan is rotation of TPM field monitors for the locations. We understand TPM rotate field monitors on locations to avoid TSP TPM collusion.

10. **Under 14.2 in data sheet, it is noted that lumpsum Contract shall be signed, payment shall be made for actual number of visits conducted in a month and AMS maintenance cost on monthly. Please clarify. The lumpsum contracts usually refer to payment of pre-agreed tranches upon completion of work. Please elaborate this further for clarity. If the number of visits in any given month increase or decrease, would the payment also fluctuate? Or will total lumpsum amount will be disbursed as per a pre-agreed disbursement plan?**

    Answer: TPM payments will be made as per actual number of visits conducted in a month and agreed AMS maintenance cost on monthly basis. However, total payment will not exceed lumpsum contract amount.

11. **Under A-1: Experience of the Firm [40], maximum 10 marks are allocated to "Number of Projects with a total project value of Monitoring & Evaluation Projects of Training/Capacity Building projects at grassroot level for donors/Government funded projects in last 10 years". Please clarify if maximum 10 marks will be given for 1 project with value more than 50 million?**

    Answer: Yes. Marks will be awarded if project meets criteria supported by evidence required in RFP document.

12. **Is there a page limit for technical proposal? Or is there page limit to the TECH 3 form?**

    Answer: No. There is no page limit. However, it is encouraged that TECH 3 is precise and qualitative.

13. **TECH 2 Consultant's Organization and Experience template has a table only. Can we add our Company's capacity narrative and relevant project sheets to it? Please clarify**

    Answer: Please provide required information as per given format in RFP document.

14. **The Form Fin 2 Summary of Costs is not clear. Please elaborate that further in the pre-bid meeting.**

Answer: It is self-explanatory form. Please provide financial information as required in FIN 2.

15. **In the Form Fin 2 Summary of Costs, 361 visits are noted to be a number given for calculation purposes only. Please clarify this. We understand that if the number of visits per month are more than 361 at the implementation stage, the payments will be made as per the unit cost for total visits completed. Please confirm.**

Answer: Visits are calculated as per target in a year and PSDF business rules for Formal (2 visits in a month), Industrial (one visit in a month) and community (one visit in a month) training programs. Number of visits may vary as per number of locations and number of classes at any given location.

16. **We understand the submission is on the tendering portal. No hardcopy of the proposal (technical and financial) is required? Please clarify.**

Answer: No hard copy of technical and financial proposal is required. Documents to be submitted online on E-Tender Portal only.

17. **Under RFP Form Tech 8 point 5, ICAP registered firms satisfying the criteria are eligible for this proposal, whereas the qualification criteria for the following implementation team members specified, in the Data Sheet Evaluation Criteria (A4) is as follows:**

Project Director	16 years of education in Business Administration or Social Sciences or Finance
M&E Specialist	16 years of education in Business Administration or Economics or commerce or statistics
Regional/District Coordinator	16 years of education in Business Administration/ Social Sciences/ Finance

It is suggested to allow other qualified Professionals e.g., FCA, FCCA, ACMA, CMA, etc. having ample experience of performing similar nature assignments for the above mentioned positions.
Answer: Please refer to Question # 37 above.

18. **Which database will be used by PSDF?**

Answer: Please refer to Question # 1 of Pre-Bid Meeting above.

19. **What interface will be available for AMS to read/write to/from database. Will be direct database access or via APIs.**

Answer: please refer to Question # 1 of Pre-Bid Meeting above.

It is advised to read instructions in RFP carefully before submission of proposal. All submission will be online through E-Tender Portal and last date of submission is Feb 28, 2022, on or before 02:30 PM. Bid Security must be submitted in the form of original CDR/ Demand Draft/ Pay Order at PSDF

office before submission deadline and a scanned copy must be attached with Technical Proposal on E-Tender Portal.

Financial form is also available on E-Tender Portal and contains 3 forms i.e., FIN-1, FIN-2, FIN-3. Please read those forms carefully before submission.

System will close after 02:30 PM on Feb 28, 2022, and no proposal can be submitted after that.

There is no lag in the E-Tender Portal. Helpline number is available for any support. Any other query can be raised through message box of E-Tender Portal and will be responded accordingly.

Template for litigation history

(On non-judicial stamp paper (not below the value of Rs. 100)

LITIGATION HISTORY

[Provide here a list and brief description of litigation history including arbitrations (pending or otherwise) with any government organization at the time of submission of proposal.]

Case title	Nature of Claim	Value of Claim	Forum	Outcome/Likely Outcome