

Ref: PROC/TPBES/P/100148

Dated: 05-Aug-2020

Announcement of Evaluation Report

Description	Details
Name of Procuring Agency:	Punjab Skills Development Fund
Title of Procurement:	Hiring of firm for Third-Party Bid Evaluation Services
Method of Procurement:	Quality and Cost Based Selection (QCBS)
Procedure of Procurement:	Expression of Interest & Request for Proposal
Date & Time of Bid Closing:	EOI 31-Jan-20 at 03:00 PM & RFP-06-May-20 at 11:00 AM
Date & Time of Bid Opening	EOI 31-Jan-20 at 03:30 PM & RFP 06-May-20 at 11:30 AM
No of EOI Received:	EOI Received=03 Qualified for RFP=02 RFP Received =02 Qualified for Financial Opening=02
Evaluation Report:	Cited Below

EOI-Eligibility:

Eligibility- Hiring of Firm for Third-Party Bid Evaluation Services				
Eligibility Criteria		A.F.Ferguson & Co	KPMG Taseer Hadi & Co	Naveed Zafar Ashfaq Jaffery & Co.
1	Should be a legal entity i.e. firm, copy of incorporation & registration certificate	Provided	Provided	Not Provided
2	Must be (SBP Category "A") auditing firm.	Provided	Provided	Provided
3	Provide National Tax Number (NTN) and General (GST)/ Provincial Sales Tax (PST), (if applicable) in the name of Organization and provide a copy of registration.	Provided	Provided	Provided
4	Active Taxpayer as per "Active Tax Payer List" of FBR.	Provided	Provided	Provided
5	Affidavit on stamp paper, declaring that firm is not blacklisted by any Government agency/authority/organization. (Original required).	Provided	Provided	Not Provided
Result		Eligible	Eligible	Ineligible

EOI-Technical Evaluation:

Sr. No.	Description	Category Points	Grand Total Points	Documents Required	A.F.Ferguson & Co	KPMG Taseer Hadi & Co
1	Worked for international donors / Government funded projects <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Experience of Firm 5 years • Experience of Firm 5 - 7 years • Experience of Firm more than 7-9 years 	10 15 20	20	Attach relevant document (Evidence copies of Contracts/Pos/Service Orders and client performance satisfactory letter.) Also fill annexure D	20	0
2	Qualification with same / similar prior experience of key management staff (based on minimum 3 members): <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Project Director: Masters (16 years of education) or equivalent with more than 7 years of relevant or similar experience • Team Lead: Masters (16 years of education) or equivalent with more than 5 years of relevant or similar experience • Bid Evaluation Specialist: Masters (16 years of education) or equivalent with more than 3 years of relevant or similar experience 		30	Provide details in Annexure C-1 and C-2 for CVs for Key management staff i.e. (Project Director, Team lead, Bid Evaluation Specialist). Also provide engagement letter. Marks will be given based on the provision of CV against all three positions of key management staff, otherwise no marks will be awarded.	30	30
3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Working experience in development sector • Working experience in skills development or vocational training assignments • Experience in Bid evaluation 	10 10 5	25	Provide documentary evidences / proofs of contract copies / service orders.	10 10 5	10 10 5
4	Office outreach <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Office only in Pakistan not in Punjab (3) • Office in Lahore (6) • Office in Lahore & other parts of Punjab (10) 	3 6 10	10	Need documentary evidence / declaration on firm's letter head	6	10
5	Annual Turnover/Total Income <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Minimum Annual turnover PKR 125 million as per the latest Income tax return or audited financial statements. • Annual turnover PKR more than 125 million but less than 150 million as per the latest Income tax return or audited financial statements. • Annual turnover PKR equal to or more than 150 million as per the latest Income tax return or audited financial statements. 	5 10 15	15	Provide copy of audited financial statements of 2017-18 or latest period/Tax returns of 2017-2018 or late period.	15	15
Total Marks					96	80

RFP-Technical Evaluation:

			PWC	KPMG
Sr. No.	Description	Category Points	Marks awarded	Marks awarded
(f)	Approach, Methodology and Work plan with E-Tendering Solution			
1	Approach			
(a)	Understanding of the assignment	10	8	6.5
(b)	Risk identification and mitigation strategy	5	5	5
2	Methodology			
(a)	Skills and tools to be used	5	4	4
3	Work plan keeping in view the timelines given in "Deliverables and Timeline" section of this RFP. Timelines to achieve the milestones keeping in view the effectiveness and efficiency	10	7	5
(g)	Approach, Methodology and Workplan without E-Tendering Solution			
1	Approach			
(a)	Understanding of the assignment	10	9	7.5
(b)	Risk identification and mitigation strategy	5	5	5
2	Methodology			
(a)	Skills and tools to be used	5	4	3
3	Work plan keeping in view the timelines given in "Deliverables and Timeline" section of this RFP. Timelines to achieve the milestones keeping in view the effectiveness and efficiency	10	7	5
(h)	Quality Management			
	Key Performance Indicators			
1	Describe the strategy for ensuring cycle time w.r.t evaluation of proposals without any error.	8	8	7
2	Identify quality parameters and measures to insure transparency & accuracy in the evaluation	6	5	1
3	Identify measures to avoid familiarity threat while visiting the facility of bidders	6	4	4
(i)	Presentation			
1	Understanding of the scope of assignment	6	5	4
2	Phase wise management of deliverables	9	7	7
3	Screening measures to address the quality parameters	5	4	4
Total Marks		100	82	68

Financial Evaluation original:

Financial Result-Third Party Bid Evaluation Services													
Bid Price in PKR offered by Qualified Bidders													
Detail of Bid Price	Firm Name	Bidding Cost (per bidding document evaluated) with E-Tendering Solution (A)						Bidding Cost (per bidding document evaluated) Cost without E-Tendering Solution (B)					
		Phase 1	Phase 2	Phase 3 with field visit	Phase 3 without field visit	Only field visit	Total A	Phase 1	Phase 2	Phase 3 with field visit	Phase 3 without field visit	Only field visit	Total B
	A.F.Ferguson & Co	10,700	10,900	19,200	10,800	8,400	60,000	12,600	11,500	19,500	10,800	8,800	63,200
KPMG Taseer Hadi & Co	6,366	7,048	7,958	3,979	3,979	29,330	6,496	7,192	8,120	4,060	4,060	29,928	

QUALITY COST BASED SELECTION											
Sr. No.	Bidder Name	Technical Score	Technical weighting	Weighted Technical Score (WTS)	Financial Bid in PKR (Inclusive of all taxes)	Financial Score	Financial Weighting	Weighted Financial Score (WFS)	Total Score	Rank	
		Max. 100	As of 80%			Max. 100	As of 20%		WTS+WFS		Max. 100
1	A.F.Ferguson & Co	82	65.60	65.60	61,600	48.10	9.62	9.62	75.22	1	
2	KPMG Taseer Hadi & Co	68	54.40	54.40	29,629	100.00	20.00	20.00	74.40	2	

Financial Evaluation after negotiation with 1st Ranked bidder

Financial Result-Third Party Bid Evaluation Services													
Bid Price in PKR offered by Qualified Bidders													
Detail of Bid Price	Firm Name	Bidding Cost (per bidding document evaluated) with E-Tendering Solution (A)						Bidding Cost (per bidding document evaluated) Cost without E-Tendering Solution (B)					
		Phase 1	Phase 2	Phase 3 with field visit	Phase 3 without field visit	Only field visit	Total A	Phase 1	Phase 2	Phase 3 with field visit	Phase 3 without field visit	Only field visit	Total B
	A.F.Ferguson & Co	8,453	8,611	12,000	6,750	5,450	41,264	9,954	9,085	12,500	7,050	5,450	44,039
KPMG Taseer Hadi & Co	6,366	7,048	7,958	3,979	3,979	29,330	6,496	7,192	8,120	4,060	4,060	29,928	

QUALITY COST BASED SELECTION											
Sr. No.	Bidder Name	Technical Score	Technical weighting	Weighted Technical Score (WTS)	Financial Bid in PKR (Inclusive of all taxes)	Financial Score	Financial Weighting	Weighted Financial Score (WFS)	Total Score	Rank	
		Max. 100	As of 80%			Max. 100	As of 20%		WTS+WFS		Max. 100
1	A.F.Ferguson & Co	82	65.60	65.60	42,652	69.47	13.89	13.89	79.49	1	
2	KPMG Taseer Hadi & Co	68	54.40	54.40	29,629	100.00	20.00	20.00	74.40	2	

The Contract shall be awarded to A.F. Ferguson & Co.

Hasaan Mehmood

Procurement Department PSDF