Announcement of Evaluation Report

**Description** | **Details**
--- | ---
Name of Procuring Agency: | Punjab Skills Development Fund
Title of Procurement: | Hiring of firm for Provisioning of Knowledge-Based Project Management Services
Method of Procurement: | Quality and Cost Based Selection (QCBS)
Procedure of Procurement: | EOI/RFP
Date & Time of Bid Closing: | EOI 08-Feb-18 at 03:00 PM & RFP-08-Mar-19 at 03:00 PM
Date & Time of Bid Opening | EOI 08-Feb-18 at 03:30 PM & RFP 08-Mar-19 at 03:30 PM
No of EOI Received: | EOI Received=13
Qualified for RFP=8
RFP Received =7
Qualified for Financial Opening=3
Evaluation Report: | Cited Below

**EOI-Eligibility:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Firm Name</th>
<th>Meets minimum requirements (y/n)</th>
<th>Provides information (y/n)</th>
<th>Final Marking (EOI)</th>
<th>Final Marking (RFP)</th>
<th>Remarks</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Atlantic Consulting Technology (Pvt) Ltd</td>
<td>y</td>
<td>y</td>
<td>0.68</td>
<td>0.56</td>
<td>Eligible</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Great Western Training (Pvt) Ltd</td>
<td>y</td>
<td>y</td>
<td>0.68</td>
<td>0.56</td>
<td>Eligible</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Peercon Consultants</td>
<td>y</td>
<td>y</td>
<td>0.68</td>
<td>0.56</td>
<td>Eligible</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>UMT Research Bureau</td>
<td>y</td>
<td>y</td>
<td>0.68</td>
<td>0.56</td>
<td>Eligible</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>GAT Consulting (Pvt) Ltd</td>
<td>y</td>
<td>y</td>
<td>0.68</td>
<td>0.56</td>
<td>Eligible</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Sustainable Development Policy Institute (SDPI)</td>
<td>y</td>
<td>y</td>
<td>0.68</td>
<td>0.56</td>
<td>Eligible</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>UTE Global (Private) Limited</td>
<td>y</td>
<td>y</td>
<td>0.68</td>
<td>0.56</td>
<td>Eligible</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>AAS Consulting</td>
<td>y</td>
<td>y</td>
<td>0.68</td>
<td>0.56</td>
<td>Eligible</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Institute of Social and Policy Sciences (ISPS)</td>
<td>y</td>
<td>y</td>
<td>0.68</td>
<td>0.56</td>
<td>Eligible</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>MAHATICS</td>
<td>y</td>
<td>y</td>
<td>0.68</td>
<td>0.56</td>
<td>Eligible</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>DMEF Consultants</td>
<td>y</td>
<td>y</td>
<td>0.68</td>
<td>0.56</td>
<td>Eligible</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>MKM Consulting Pvt. Ltd</td>
<td>y</td>
<td>y</td>
<td>0.68</td>
<td>0.56</td>
<td>Eligible</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>DMEF Training &amp; Consulting</td>
<td>y</td>
<td>y</td>
<td>0.68</td>
<td>0.56</td>
<td>Eligible</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**CONSULTANT SELECTION COMMITTEE (CSC)**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Remarks</th>
<th>Signature</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Ali Akbar Rehman, Chief Operating Officer</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Syed Faisal Malik Jaffar, CEO</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Asim Pasha, Head Human Resource</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Faisal Raheel, Head Procurement</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms. Nasir Jumal, Assistant Manager Research</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## EOI-Technical Evaluation:

### EOI-TECHNICAL EVALUATION FOR KNOWLEDGE BASED PROJECT MANAGEMENT SERVICES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Experience of Firm</th>
<th>SHM</th>
<th>ABACUS Consulting</th>
<th>VTT Global</th>
<th>SIACON</th>
<th>Grant Thornton</th>
<th>JAKA</th>
<th>CHRP Consulting</th>
<th>GAT Consulting</th>
<th>BNV Rice Consultants</th>
<th>Statistics</th>
<th>i-SAP</th>
<th>URIF</th>
<th>Precor</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a) Experience in research, knowledge and consistent based work.</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>7.5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>4.5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b) Experience in conducting basic MBE/SE, writing TSOA, research reports, demonstrating additional with equalization.</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>7.5</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c) Experience in writing technical reports and related documents.</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>7.5</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d) Consulted management, working with government, international organizations or for design consulting offices.</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e) Managed management of multiple projects.</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total Experience of Firm</strong></td>
<td>40</td>
<td>12.00</td>
<td>9.00</td>
<td>10.00</td>
<td>9.00</td>
<td>10.00</td>
<td>12.00</td>
<td>10.00</td>
<td>10.00</td>
<td>10.00</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>2.00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Team Structure and Profile</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a) Project Manager - Master's degree or equivalent and 5 years.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b) Team Lead Specialist - Master's degree or equivalent and 5 years.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c) Research Assistant - Bachelor's degree or equivalent and 5 years.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d) Support Staff Expert - Bachelor’s degree or equivalent and 5 years.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total - Team Structure</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Company Performance

| a) Less than Rs. 50,000,000 | 0   |
| b) Rs. 50,000,000 to Rs. 75,000,000 | 50  |
| c) Rs. 75,000,000 to Rs. 100,000,000 | 50  |
| d) Rs. 100,000,000 and above | 50  |
| **Total - Financial Turnover** | 40  | 20.00             | 20.00    | 15.00  | 10.00          | 8.00 | 6.00           | 4.00           | 3.00               | 2.00       | 1.00 | 1.00| 0.00 |

| Total Score | 300.00 | 120.00 | 120.00 | 120.00 | 120.00 | 120.00 | 120.00 | 120.00 | 120.00 | 120.00 | 120.00 | 120.00 | 120.00 | 120.00 | 120.00 |

### Consultant Selection Committee

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Designation</th>
<th>Comments</th>
<th>Signature</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Ali Akbar Bosan</td>
<td>Chief Operating Officer</td>
<td>Qualified</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Syed Farnousse Jafri</td>
<td>Chief Financial Officer</td>
<td>Qualified</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Asim Pasha</td>
<td>Head Human Resource</td>
<td>Qualified</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Faisal Rafiq</td>
<td>Head Procurement</td>
<td>Qualified</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms. Mashal Yousuf</td>
<td>AM Research</td>
<td>Qualified</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Note: The signature indicates the approval of the selection process.*
**RFP-Techincal Evaluation:**

### RFP Technical Evaluation- Provision of Knowledge Based Project Management Services

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Proposal Evaluation Sheet</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>7</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Experience of Firm [4]</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Concept paper</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Project Management document of any one assignment</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Published report and/or a policy recommendations document</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total Marks [Experience of Firm]</strong></td>
<td>30</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Approach &amp; Methodology [40]</strong></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Understanding of the client's need (not more than one page)</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Identifications of critical success factors that will be considered to make this assignment successful (not more than 2 pages)</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overall methodology adopted to make the project successful on the following criteria: (not more than 5 pages)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Key elements</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Phasing of the assignment</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Final deliverables</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Risk identification and mitigation strategies</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total Marks [Approach &amp; Methodology]</strong></td>
<td>40</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Team Structure [36]</strong></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Key Management – MUST have Minimum 5 years of Project Management experience. (Provide CV)</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Support staff – MUST have minimum 2 years of Project Management experience. (Provide CV)</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Report writing specialties, MUST have minimum 3 years’ experience of report writing. Attached evidence.</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>RFP Technical Evaluation- Provision of Knowledge Based Project Management Services</strong></th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>7</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Proficiency with Project Management Software and Tools: (Provide Supportive Evidence)</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Staffing schedule according to Workplan - minimum 70% of proposed team members MUST be full time staff (Employment letter)</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total Marks [Team Structure]</strong></td>
<td>30</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Grand Total</strong></td>
<td>100</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>85</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>71</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Consultant Selection Committee

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sr</th>
<th>Name of member</th>
<th>Comments</th>
<th>Signatures</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Mr. Ali Akbar Rose, Chief Operating Officer</td>
<td>Bee prove accurncy</td>
<td>[Signature]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Mr. Fauziah Safi, Chief Financial Officer</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Mr. Asim Pasha, Head Human Resource</td>
<td>Please proceed accurncy</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Mr. Faisal Kaffa, Head Procurement</td>
<td>Please proceed with financial</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Ms. Nishma Yousaf, Assistant Manager H &amp; P</td>
<td>Please proceed</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Financial Evaluation:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sr. No.</th>
<th>Bidder Name</th>
<th>Technical Score</th>
<th>Technical Weighting</th>
<th>Financial Bid in PKR (Inclusive of all taxes)</th>
<th>Financial Score</th>
<th>Financial Weighing</th>
<th>Weighted Financial Score (WFS)</th>
<th>Total Score</th>
<th>Rank</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Abacus Consulting Pvt. Ltd</td>
<td>85</td>
<td>68</td>
<td>5,281,774.0</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>5.1</td>
<td>5.1</td>
<td>71.1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>SDPI</td>
<td>66</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>1,240,000.0</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>20.0</td>
<td>20.0</td>
<td>72.6</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>I-SAPS</td>
<td>71</td>
<td>56.8</td>
<td>2,341,717.0</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>11.4</td>
<td>11.4</td>
<td>68.2</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Consultant Selection Committee

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sr.</th>
<th>Name of member</th>
<th>Comments</th>
<th>Signatures</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Mr. A. Ahsan, COO</td>
<td>Cost seems very high. Need to negotiate.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Mr. Syed Faizuddin, CFO</td>
<td>Recommended for financial negotiations as per issue (complained).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Mr. Ahsan, Head Human Resource</td>
<td>Please negotiate as one of the lowest; for further negotiations, follow procedure.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Ms. Fatima, Head Procurement</td>
<td>Need to negotiate the cost.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Financial Evaluation after negotiation with 1st Ranked bidder

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sr. No.</th>
<th>Bidder Name</th>
<th>Technical Score</th>
<th>Technical Weighting</th>
<th>Financial Bid in PKR (Inclusive of all taxes)</th>
<th>Financial Score</th>
<th>Financial Weighing</th>
<th>Weighted Financial Score (WFS)</th>
<th>Total Score</th>
<th>Rank</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Abacus Consulting Pvt. Ltd</td>
<td>85</td>
<td>68</td>
<td>2,496,000.0</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>10.2</td>
<td>10.2</td>
<td>74.7</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>SDPI</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>1,340,000.0</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>20.0</td>
<td>20.0</td>
<td>74.0</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>I-SAPS</td>
<td>71</td>
<td>56.8</td>
<td>2,341,717.0</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>14.4</td>
<td>14.4</td>
<td>68.2</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Consultant Selection Committee

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sr.</th>
<th>Name of member</th>
<th>Comments</th>
<th>Signatures</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Mr. A. Ahsan, COO</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Mr. Syed Faizuddin, CFO</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Mr. Ahsan, Head Human Resource</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Ms. Fatima, Head Procurement</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Ms. Mashal Yousuf, (AM Research &amp; Planning)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>